

## Chullin – Simanim

### פרק ד – בהמה המקשה

#### Daf 68 – סו ח

##### 1. A limb of an עובר which momentarily left the womb is not permitted through the mother's *shechitah*

The fourth Perek begins: בהמה המקשה לילד – if *an animal was in difficult labor*, והוציא העובר את ידו והחזירו – *and the fetus put its foreleg out of the womb and drew it back* before the mother was *shechted*, it is permitted for consumption (even without its own *shechitah*), as the Gemara will derive. However, הוציא את ראשו – if *it put its head out of the womb*, then even if it drew it back in, הרי זה כילוד – *it is considered fully born*, and is not permitted through the mother's *shechitah*. Rav Yehudah says in Rav's name: ואבר עצמו אסור – *the limb itself which left the womb is forbidden*, despite being pulled back in before the *shechitah*. He *darshens*: ובשר בשדה טרפה לא תאכלו – *and meat "in the field", tereifah you shall not eat*, teaching כיון שיצא בשר חוץ למחיצתו נאסר – *once meat has left its boundary, it is forbidden*. Here, since the limb left its "boundary" of the womb, it cannot be permitted with the mother's *shechitah*. Although quoted Rebbe Yochanan arguing and permitting even the returned limb, this is refuted.

##### 2. "מקום חתך" – the "place of the cut" becomes permitted by returning into the womb

According to Rav's ruling, that a limb which left the womb cannot be permitted through the mother's *shechitah*, our Mishnah which says "it" is permitted must refer to the rest of the fetus, which never left the womb. The Gemara objects that if so, why does the Mishnah specify that the fetus drew its leg back in before *shechitah*, since this ruling would apply even if it did not!? The Gemara eventually concludes that the Mishnah discussed a case where the fetus drew its foreleg back in למקום חתך – for the "place of the cut," referring to the point of the leg at the border of the womb (where it would be "cut" if one were to sever the part of the leg which left the womb). This meat never "left" the womb and can theoretically be permitted with the mother's *shechitah*; however, since it is not inside the womb (but at its border), it must return to the womb before *shechitah* for it to be permitted.

##### 3. *Machlokes* if לידה לאברים יש

In מערבא (Eretz Yisroel), they taught the *machlokes* between Rav and Rebbe Yochanan differently: Rav says יש לידה – *there is "birth" for individual limbs*, and Rebbe Yochanan says אין לידה לאברים. Rav holds that when a fetus's limb leaves the womb, it is considered "born," and cannot be permitted with the mother's *shechitah*, and Rebbe Yochanan disagrees. According to this version, Rav would even prohibit the minor part of a limb which never left the womb, since the majority of that limb left, rendering the entire limb "born." The Gemara inquires, according to Rebbe Yochanan, if the fetus stuck out a foreleg and drew it back, then put forth another leg and drew it back, עד ששלימו לרובו – and did so with other body parts *until its majority in total* left the womb, do we say that most of the fetus left the womb, and it is considered born, or since each individual limb returned, they do not combine to constitute a majority? If they do not combine because each limb returned, what if each limb was cut off as it left the womb? Do they combine to form a majority, or perhaps רובא בבית אחת בעין – *we require a majority outside the womb at one time*? These questions are not resolved.

##### Siman – *S'chach*

When the *shochet* who used a cow made out of *s'chach* to demonstrate *halachos* related to labor, showed how a foreleg of the fetus that protrudes from the womb is not permitted even if it retracts, unlike the מקום חתך which is permitted, a *talmid* asked if יש לידה לאברים making the minority part of the limb which never left the womb forbidden since the majority of it had left.



When the *shochet* who used a cow made out of *s'chach* to demonstrate *halachos* related to labor, showed how a foreleg of the fetus that protrudes from the womb is not permitted even if it retracts, unlike the *מקום חתך* which is permitted, a talmid asked if *יש לידה לאברים?* making the minority part of the limb which never left the womb forbidden since the majority of it had left.

### 3 things to remember

1. A limb of an עובר which momentarily left the womb is not permitted through the mother's *shechitah*
2. "מקום חתך" – the "place of the cut" becomes permitted by returning into the womb
3. *Machlokes* if *יש לידה לאברים?*

